Liectionic i illing. Neceived, Clerk's Offi	CE 10/23/2017
BEFORE THE	Page 1
ILLINOIS POLLUTION CONT	TROL BOARD
CITY OF BENTON FIRE DEPARTMENT, Petitioner,  -vs-  ILLINOIS ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY, Respondent.	) ) DOCKET PCB 17-1 ) ) ) )

Hearing held, pursuant to notice, on Wednesday, October 18, 2017, at the hour of 10:00 a.m. at 1021 N. Grand Avenue East, Springfield, Illinois, before CAROL WEBB, duly appointed Hearing Officer.

L.A. REPORTING SERVICE (312)419-9292

REPORTER: LAUREL A. PATKES, CSR #084-001340

L.A. Court Reporters, L.L.C. 312-419-9292

```
Page 2
 1
     APPEARANCES:
 2
         PATRICK SHAW
 3
         Attorney at Law
         80 Bellerive
 4
         Springfield, Illinois 62704
 5
                         appearing on behalf of
                         Petitioner;
 6
 7
         MELANIE JARVIS
         IEPA Assistant Counsel
         1021 N. Grand Avenue East
 8
         Springfield, Illinois 62794
 9
                         appearing on behalf of
10
                         Respondent.
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
```

	Electronic Filing: Receiv				Page 3
1		I N D	E X		
2	WITNESS	DIRECT	CROSS	REDIRECT	RECROSS
3	MARVIN JOHNSON By Mr. Shaw	6		19/23	
5	By Ms. Jarvis		14		21/25
6	MICHAEL PIGGUSH By Ms. Jarvis By Mr. Shaw	30	38		
7	by Mr. Shaw		30		
8					
9					
10					
11					
12					
13					
14		EXHIB	ITS		
15			ID	ENTIFIED	ADMITTED
16	Petitioner's Exhibit 1	-		29	29
17	Respondent's Exhibits	1 & 2		13	
18					
19					
20					
21					
22					
23					
24					

L.A. Court Reporters, L.L.C. 312-419-9292

PROCEEDINGS  HEARING OFFICER WEBB: Good morning.  My name is Carol Webb. This is the hearing for PCB  17-1, City of Benton Fire Department versus IEPA.  It is October 18th, and we are beginning at 10 a.m.  For the record, although this
3 My name is Carol Webb. This is the hearing for PCB 4 17-1, City of Benton Fire Department versus IEPA. 5 It is October 18th, and we are beginning at 10 a.m. 6 For the record, although this
4 17-1, City of Benton Fire Department versus IEPA. 5 It is October 18th, and we are beginning at 10 a.m. 6 For the record, although this
5 It is October 18th, and we are beginning at 10 a.m. 6 For the record, although this
6 For the record, although this
7 facility is located in Franklin County, there was n
8 known public interest in this case so I granted the
9 parties' request to hold the hearing in Springfield
10 At issue is the agency's denial of
11 the consulting materials cost as part of the Stage
12 site investigation plan for petitioner's site
13 located at 107 North Maple Street in Benton. The
14 Pollution Control Board members will make the final
15 decision in this case. My purpose is to conduct th
16 hearing in a neutral and orderly manner so we have
17 clear record of the proceedings.
18 The decision deadline is June 21,
19 2018.
20 There are people from the Agency
21 present but no members of the public present to
22 comment but written comment may be filed with the
23 clerk by November 1st.
24 This hearing was noticed pursuant to

```
Page 5
       the act in the Board's rules and will be conducted
 1
       pursuant to Sections 101.600 through 101.632 of the
 2
 3
       Board's procedural rules.
 4
                      At this time, I will ask the parties
 5
       to please make their appearances on the record.
 6
                      MR. SHAW:
                                 Patrick Shaw on behalf of
 7
       the City of Benton Fire Department.
 8
                      MS. JARVIS: Melanie Jarvis on behalf
 9
       of the Illinois Environmental Protection Agency.
10
                      HEARING OFFICER WEBB:
                                              Thank you.
11
                      Are there any preliminary matters to
12
       discuss on the record?
13
                      MS. JARVIS: No.
14
                      MR. SHAW: No.
15
                      HEARING OFFICER WEBB:
                                              Okay.
16
       Mr. Shaw, would you like to give an opening
17
       statement?
18
                      MR. SHAW: I'll waive opening
19
       statement.
20
                      HEARING OFFICER WEBB: Ms. Jarvis?
2.1
                      MS. JARVIS: I will also waive
22
       opening statement.
23
                      HEARING OFFICER WEBB:
                                              Okay.
2.4
                      Mr. Shaw, you may call your first
```

```
Page 6
 1
       witness.
 2
                      MR. SHAW: I'd like to call Marvin
 3
       Johnson.
 4
                      HEARING OFFICER WEBB: Mr. Johnson,
 5
       would you please come up here?
 6
                      Would the court reporter please swear
 7
       in the witness?
 8
                           (Whereupon the witness was sworn
 9
                           by the reporter.)
10
                      MR. SHAW: I just need a minute to
11
       get my notes.
12
                      HEARING OFFICER WEBB:
                                               Okay.
13
14
                           MARVIN JOHNSON
15
       called as a witness herein, on behalf of Petitioner,
16
       having been first duly sworn on his oath, was
       examined and testified as follows:
17
18
19
                         DIRECT EXAMINATION
20
       BY MR. SHAW:
21
                      May the witness state his name?
              Q.
22
              Α.
                      Marvin Johnson.
23
                      Mr. Johnson are you familiar with the
              Q.
24
       City of Benton Fire Department underground storage
```

		Page 7
1	tank remediati	on project?
2	Α.	Yes.
3	Q.	How are you familiar with it?
4	Α.	I serve as the manager of
5	undergraduate	storage tank services for Chase
6	Environmental	and review all correspondence that
7	goes to the Ag	gency.
8	Q.	Okay. And do you do that on multiple
9	sites?	
10	Α.	Yes.
11	Q.	Approximately how many sites are you
12	involved in ri	ght now?
13	Α.	Probably 80.
14	Q.	And are these all sites involving the
15	LUST program?	
16	Α.	Yes.
17	Q.	What is you're highest educational
18	attainment?	
19	Α.	I have a Bachelor of Science from
20	Eastern Illino	ois University with a major in
21	environmental	biology.
22	Q.	Okay. And when did you first start
23	working in unc	derground storage tank remediation?
24	Α.	January of 2000.

L.A. Court Reporters, L.L.C. 312-419-9292

	Page 8
1	Q. Okay. And who did you work for at
2	that time?
3	A. United Science Industries in
4	Woodlawn, Illinois.
5	Q. Did United Science Industries do a
6	lot of underground storage tank program, leaking
7	underground storage tank program related work?
8	A. Yes.
9	Q. What was the nature of your work for
10	USI?
11	A. I started as an assistant project
12	manager; then moved to project manager; then senior
13	project manager; and then supervisory role looking
14	over other project managers.
15	Q. After working for USI, who did you
16	work for?
17	A. Then I came on with Chase
18	Environmental.
19	Q. Do you have any idea how many
20	undergraduate storage tank projects you've been
21	involved in in your career?
22	A. I would guess in the neighborhood of
23	500.
24	Q. And these would each involve usually

	Page 9
1	multiple submittals, planning documents, budget
2	documents to the Illinois Environmental Protection
3	Agency?
4	A. Yes, everything from the initial
5	report to the corrective action plan and all
6	associated reimbursement requests.
7	Q. With respect to consulting material
8	costs, are you familiar with consulting material
9	costs as they are charged in this industry?
10	A. Yes.
11	Q. How are you familiar with them?
12	A. I have been on the side of developing
13	rates initially with United Science, and then I do
14	review of other consultants rates on materials and
15	also review on the reimbursement requests as well.
16	Q. Do you have opportunities to review
17	rates from other consultants?
18	A. Yes.
19	Q. When does that happen?
20	A. That happens at least once a year,
21	and then Chase also has at least three individuals
22	that have worked with other consultants and were
23	familiar with the other consultants rates.
24	Q. Does Chase employ people that used to

	Page 10
1	work for competing consultants also?
2	A. Yes.
3	Q. Does it employ at times people that
4	used to work for the Illinois Environmental
5	Protection Agency?
6	A. Yes.
7	Q. Does Chase ever take over projects
8	that another consultant started?
9	A. Yes.
10	Q. This case as I'm sure you're aware
11	sort of involves a site investigation submittal.
12	Can you describe the nature of the site
13	investigation work at the property?
14	A. The site investigation work as I
15	remember at this property involved installation of
16	monitoring wells to determine if groundwater quality
17	had been impacted and if no additional soil sampling
18	was necessary and that the site investigation
19	completion report and Stage I actual cost work was
20	submitted.
21	Q. Did the site investigation completion
22	report indicate what's to happen next?
23	A. I believe the corrective action plan
24	and corrective action completion report were the

		Page 11
1	next to be sub	omitted.
2	Q.	Do you recall whether or not there
3	were any diffi	culties with reimbursement during the
4	early action s	tage?
5	Α.	There were none.
6	Q.	You received an e-mail from
7	Mr. Piggush or	June 9, 2016.
8		Do you recall that?
9	Α.	Yes.
10	Q.	And why did he e-mail you?
11	Α.	He had a few questions about some of
12	the technical	aspects of the SICR, the site
13	investigation	completion report, and he had some
14	questions rega	rding the consulting materials.
15	Q.	What did he do in response to that
16	inquiry?	
17	Α.	I replied to his e-mail with an
18	e-mail respons	e.
19	Q.	And that e-mail response is in the
20	record so I'm	not really asking you to memorize it
21	or repeat it b	out approximately how much time did he
22	spend preparin	g that response?
23	Α.	I would guess about three hours.
24	Q.	And what is your billable rate

L.A. Court Reporters, L.L.C. 312-419-9292

	Page 12
1	pursuant to the subpart (h) regulations?
2	A. I believe around \$125 an hour as a
3	senior project manager.
4	Q. Your one part e-mail response
5	indicates that you talked to a rental company.
6	Can you explain how that came about?
7	A. I believe I was asked to contact the
8	rental company to determine how they came up with
9	their rates, and the rental company that we used, I
10	called, requested the information stating that we
11	were trying to put something together for the EPA
12	and that we wanted to know how they determined their
13	rates. I believe it was Reis Environmental. And
14	they didn't provide any information other than
15	stating they were in business to make money.
16	Q. It sounds like they did not want to
17	help. Is that
18	A. No. That's correct.
19	Q. Prior to this date, had you ever
20	received a request for a mathematical financial
21	derivation?
22	A. No.
23	Q. Since that date, have you ever
24	received a requests for mathematical financial

```
Page 13
       derivation?
 1
 2
              Α.
                      No.
 3
                      Based upon your experience in the
              0.
 4
       underground storage tank program or working with the
 5
       underground storage tank program, are the rates for
 6
       consulting materials in your submittal consistent
 7
       with those that have historically been approved by
 8
       the Agency?
 9
              Α.
                      Yes.
10
                      Based upon your experience working
              Q.
       with the leaking underground storage tank program,
11
12
       were the rates submitted reasonable?
13
              Α.
                      Yes.
                      MR. SHAW: I have no further
14
15
       questions.
16
                      HEARING OFFICER WEBB:
                                              Ms. Jarvis?
17
                      MS. JARVIS: I'm going to need
       stickers for exhibits.
18
19
                      How do you like these marked -- A and
20
       B or 1 and 2?
21
                      HEARING OFFICER WEBB: Probably 1 and
22
       2.
23
                           (Respondent's Exhibits 1 and 2
2.4
                           were marked for identification.)
```

	Page 14
1	CROSS-EXAMINATION
2	BY MS. JARVIS:
3	Q. I'm going to start with the e-mails,
4	okay?
5	A. Okay.
6	Q. When Mr. Piggush sent you the e-mail,
7	how much of that e-mail was technical and how much
8	was concerning the rates?
9	A. I just
10	Q. Do you want to see the e-mail?
11	A. Yeah. It would probably help.
12	Q. This is on page 10 and 11 of the
13	record?
14	A. So.
15	Q. Two questions were regarding the
16	rates and the rest of the questions were technical.
17	A. Yes.
18	Q. So out of your three hours of working
19	on this document, did you spend more time with the
20	technical or more time on the rates?
21	A. More time on the rates.
22	Q. Okay. And why was that?
23	A. I think that I was more aware of my
24	response with the technical aspects than with the
1	

```
Page 15
 1
       rate aspect.
 2
                       Okay. And you testified that your
              Q.
 3
       rates were reasonable and they were what was
 4
       normally charged, correct?
 5
              Α.
                       Yes.
 6
              Q.
                       Okay.
                             I have to two e-mails.
                                                       One is
 7
       Kathy Elston from Hernando Albarricin, and in that,
 8
       the amount for the PIB that you charged in this case
 9
       was $135, and here your firm agreed to a $75 rate,
10
       is that correct?
11
                       That appears to be the case.
              Α.
12
                       And here's an e-mail where Kathy
13
       mentions this e-mail and your agreement to a $75
14
       rate, and this is a response from you which says
15
       that that is acceptable, is that correct?
16
                       That is correct.
17
                       HEARING OFFICER WEBB:
                                               That was
18
       Respondent's Exhibit 1.
19
                       MS. JARVIS: Correct.
20
                       You work for United Service
              0.
2.1
       Industries?
22
              Α.
                       United Science, yes.
23
              Q.
                       Science Industries.
2.4
                       And what is the status of that firm?
```

L.A. Court Reporters, L.L.C. 312-419-9292

		Page 16
1	Α.	They went bankrupt.
2	Q.	And did you work for them up until
3	the dissolution	n of the firm?
4	Α.	No.
5	Q.	You left prior?
6	Α.	Yes.
7	Q.	In your responses to the e-mails,
8	there is one wh	nere you say that you contacted Reis
9	Equipment, but	you also state that nothing in your
10	list was rented	d.
11	Α.	That's correct.
12	Q.	And the question was actually if the
13	item is rented,	please provide a written cost
14	estimate from t	the rental company.
15		Is that correct?
16	Α.	I am not sure without seeing it.
17	Q.	Okay. I'll show you page 11 of the
18	record. Here's	s the question. Why don't you read
19	that question o	outloud.
20	Α.	If the item is rented, then please
21	provide the wri	itten cost estimate from the rental
22	company for how	v the rental rate for the item was
23	determined.	
24	Q.	However, you then write no item was

	Page 17
1	rented?
2	A. That's correct.
3	Q. Yet you still took the time to call a
4	rental company when no item was rented even though
5	the EPA's question was clear that you're only to do
6	so if the item was rented?
7	A. I'm not sure that I read that
8	question as being that clear at the time.
9	Q. Okay. The next one, please read the
10	next question.
11	A. Please discuss if it is appropriate
12	for the item to be charged as a direct
13	Q. Oh, wrong question. Sorry. We'll
14	get to direct and indirect.
15	It's this question down here, No. 2,
16	or No. 1, I'm sorry, on page 10 of the record, 4A1.
17	A. If the item is owned, then please
18	provide a mathematical financial derivation for how
19	the unit rate for the item was determined. Include
20	such variables as purchase cost including receipts,
21	operation and maintenance cost, estimated project
22	usage and estimated product life.
23	Q. Okay. And then your response was
24	that you included all the information, and you're

```
Page 18
 1
       not going to include anything else.
 2
              Α.
                      My response was Chase has included
 3
       all information required and in accordance with the
       Illinois EPA forms and instructions existing at the
 4
 5
       time of submittal.
 6
                      The rates proposed within the
 7
       consulting materials forms are rates that have been
 8
       consistently approved in our client's budgets and
 9
       reimbursement request.
10
                      So even though you were asked for
              Q.
11
       supporting documentation, you refused to give any,
12
       isn't that correct?
13
                       I provided documentation.
14
       responded via e-mail.
15
              0.
                      You responded to the e-mail but you
16
       didn't provide any supporting documentation for your
17
       cost, any receipts, any invoices or anything like
18
       that, isn't that correct?
19
                      I responded as I thought accordingly.
              Α.
20
              0.
                      Right. You responded to an e-mail,
21
       but you did not supply any invoices, is that
22
       correct?
23
                      I don't have any invoices.
              Α.
2.4
                      Okay. You didn't supply any sort of
              Q.
```

	•
	Page 19
1	thing to tell us about the cost of the item.
2	A. Correct.
3	Q. Do you own the PID?
4	A. Yes.
5	Q. Do you use it at multiple sites?
6	A. Yes.
7	Q. What's the normal cost of a PID?
8	A. I'm not sure that I could answer
9	that. There are many, many types of PIDs.
10	Q. And do you know the cost of your PID?
11	A. No.
12	MS. JARVIS: I have no further
13	questions.
14	
15	REDIRECT EXAMINATION
16	BY MR. SHAW:
17	Q. Mr. Johnson, I think you were asked
18	to review some e-mails regarding agreed rates.
19	What was the context in which rates
20	have been agreed to in the last year or two that
21	were lower than what were requested in the various
22	submittals?
23	A. I believe those e-mails indicated \$75
24	which is what we were told that the EPA would
1	

	Page 20
1	approve without documentation or we would receive
2	zero reimbursement, so we had no choice but to
3	Q. Does the EPA show you what rule that
4	said that?
5	A. No.
6	Q. Were you given the \$75 option by
7	Mr. Piggush in this case?
8	A. No.
9	Q. I believe the record indicates that
10	you received an e-mail from Mr. Piggush on a Monday
11	evening or it was sent on a Monday evening at 4:30
12	for the decision deadline of Friday.
13	Assuming you could have followed up
14	and tried to find e-mails, would you have been able
15	to get those e-mails by Friday?
16	A. I believe
17	Q. Let me strike that.
18	Assuming that you could find these
19	invoices, do you think you could have the invoices
20	for all ten of these items or so by Friday?
21	A. I believe that week I was in the
22	field most of the week so I would not have been able
23	to get that information at that time.
24	Q. How about the other information

```
Page 21
       besides invoices that are referenced such as how
 1
 2
       much these things are used or maintenance
 3
       obligations?
 4
              Α.
                      No.
 5
                                 I have no further
                      MR. SHAW:
 6
       questions.
 7
                      MS. JARVIS:
                                    I have follow-up.
 8
                      HEARING OFFICER WEBB:
 9
10
                         RECROSS-EXAMINATION
11
       BY MS. JARVIS:
12
                      Okay. When Mr. Shaw just asked you a
              0.
       question about the $75, you said you had no choice
13
14
       but to accept that fee.
15
                      Did the Illinois EPA extort you in
16
       some way or force you to approve it?
17
              Α.
                      They would have been holding up -- I
18
       believe the Mattoon School reimbursement request was
19
       a hundred and some thousand dollars, so it would
20
       have been holding up a hundred thousand dollar
21
       reimbursement request to try to get an additional
22
       $60.
23
                      Well, that's not exactly true, is it?
              Q.
2.4
       I mean, it would have been a partial approval where
```

	Page 22
1	you would have gotten most of the money except for
2	\$135?
3	A. Well, we would have had to appeal the
4	entire package.
5	Q. No. You would have still gotten a
6	half approval and would have gotten into the
7	payment, and all that would have been under appeal
8	is the \$135.
9	A. That's possible, but that does not
10	sound correct.
11	Q. And plus, you have appealed several
12	cases that have been denied, isn't that correct?
13	So you had other options. You
14	weren't force to accept a \$75 rate.
15	A. Without filing an additional appeal,
16	that would have meant we had to take the cut.
17	Q. Then I'm going to show you page 13 of
18	the record, an e-mail from Mr. Piggush to you, and
19	would you please read the question or the answer
20	right there, the question that he asked?
21	A. "Okay. That is fine. Just for now,
22	all I need is a time extension. You can submit the
23	rest of the information whenever it is ready."
24	Q. So you had the option to get a time

```
Page 23
 1
       extension in order to submit any additional
 2
       information that you wanted, but you refused to give
 3
       a time extension, isn't that correct?
 4
              Α.
                      We chose not to give a time
 5
       extension.
                      MS. JARVIS: I have no further
 6
 7
       questions.
 8
                      MR. SHAW:
                                  I just want to give the
 9
       witness an opportunity to answer one of the
10
       questions here.
11
12
                       REDIRECT EXAMINATION
13
       BY MR. SHAW:
14
              0.
                      You were indicating before you were
15
       cut off that you were concerned that disputing the
16
       small items would result in not getting paid a
17
       hundred thousand dollars from the whole package.
18
       Could you explain why?
19
                      Well, my fear was if we had to
              Α.
20
       possibly file an extension or provide additional
       documentation, which I have done many times and it's
21
22
       never been successful to this point, I didn't want
23
       to go through that because as a matter of cost to
24
       the company, it did not make sense to think about
```

	Page 24
1	filing an appeal for \$75 on a package that is well
2	over a hundred thousand dollars.
3	Q. And how much has the City of Benton
4	been paid for the site investigation work to date?
5	A. Nothing.
6	Q. Just the site investigation.
7	A. Nothing.
8	Q. And when you say you've submitted
9	documents several times without anything useful
10	coming of it, what type of documents have you
11	submitted?
12	A. In discussion with the Agency, we
13	have tried to provide as much documentation as we
14	can on justifying our rates. The rate of \$75 seems
15	to come from somewhere, somebody found a rental
16	rate, and that's what was agreed to, but Chase never
17	agreed to that rental rate.
18	Q. Are there issues with the rental rate
19	that aren't reflected in ownership?
20	A. Yes. By owning our own PID, I
21	believe that we save our clients money and save the
22	fund money because, for example, if we rented the
23	PID, if we're going to drill on Tuesday, you have to
24	have it delivered on Monday because you cannot wait

```
Page 25
       till it shows up to then leave and go do the work.
 1
 2
                      Then there's also cost for shipping
 3
       equipment back, our cost for renting it. Somebody
 4
       has to package it and send it back, and so in our
 5
       estimation, our cost is about 50 percent less than
 6
       what it would cost to rent it to do the same job.
 7
                      MR. SHAW:
                                 No further questions.
 8
                      MS. JARVIS: I have further
 9
       questions.
10
11
                         RECROSS-EXAMINATION
12
       BY MS. JARVIS:
13
                      In the Benton case, were your
              Ο.
       personnel costs denied?
14
15
              Α.
                      No.
16
                      So only the material costs were
              0.
17
       denied?
18
              Α.
                      Correct.
19
                      So if you were not paid for the
20
       personnel cost, that's probably due to the State of
21
       Illinois' budget concerns because those were not
22
       denied?
23
                      We have not submitted a package
              Α.
24
       because we were hoping that this appeal would have
```

```
Page 26
       been resolved already but it has not.
 1
 2
                       So even though your personnel costs
              Q.
 3
       have been approved, you haven't submitted a package
 4
       for them, and that is why you have not been paid for
 5
       them.
 6
              Α.
                       That is correct.
 7
              Q.
                       Okay. In the case of the Mattoon,
 8
       did you submit information for the concrete tickets
 9
       for the paving?
10
              Α.
                       I do not remember.
11
                       Did you submit information for your
              0.
12
       Chase vehicle?
13
              Α.
                       No.
14
                       Was that denied?
              0.
                       I don't remember.
15
              Α.
16
              Ο.
                       Did you submit information for the
17
       digital camera?
18
              Α.
                       No.
19
                       Was that denied?
              Q.
20
                       I don't know.
              Α.
21
                       Well, you let some things go ahead
              Q.
22
       and be denied even though in this case you accepted
23
       a $75 PID in order for it not to be denied.
24
                       I believe the vehicle was already
              Α.
```

```
Page 27
       approved in the budget so it was not denied, and
 1
 2
       possibly the same with the digital camera, but
 3
       without seeing the letter on the reimbursement, I
       don't remember what was denied and what was not. I
 4
 5
       review too many.
 6
              Q.
                      Okay. But it's possible that items
 7
       were denied in that case because you did not submit
 8
       supporting documentation?
 9
              Α.
                      Possible.
10
                      MS. JARVIS: No further questions.
11
                      HEARING OFFICER WEBB: Mr. Shaw?
12
                      MR. SHAW: I don't have any.
13
                      I'm going to ask if Melanie would
14
       agree to allow that to be admitted into evidence
15
       just as it is. I've handed her the instructions for
16
       the budget and billing forms.
17
                      MS. JARVIS: I'm going to object
18
       because that's been updated. This is April 2009.
19
                      MR. SHAW: What date was it updated?
20
                      MS. JARVIS: October 2016.
21
                      MR. SHAW: Well, after the decision
22
       was made then.
23
                      MS. JARVIS: When was the decision
2.4
       made?
```

```
Page 28
 1
                      MR. SHAW:
                                The decision was made
 2.
       June 2016.
 3
                      MS. JARVIS: And what date did you
 4
       say it was?
 5
                      MR. LOWDER: I believe it was
 6
       October.
                 That's just my recollection.
 7
                      MS. JARVIS: Okay. We will allow it
 8
       in subject to objection.
 9
                      MR. SHAW:
                                 How about -- well, I mean,
10
       I'll agree to admit it for what it is subject to
11
       argument about it.
12
                      MS. JARVIS: Well, that's what I
13
              I'm going to object in argument.
14
                      MR. SHAW: Relevance.
15
                      MS. JARVIS: Yes.
16
                      MR. SHAW:
                                Okay.
17
                      I had started marking this
18
       Petitioner's Exhibit something. Would that be
19
       confusing or should I just go ahead and mark it
20
       Petitioner's Exhibit 1?
21
                      HEARING OFFICER WEBB: Petitioner's
22
       Exhibit 1 is fine.
23
2.4
```

	Page 29
1	(Whereupon Petitioner's Exhibit 1
2	was marked for identification as
3	of this date.)
4	HEARING OFFICER WEBB: Did you reach
5	an agreement on how you would want to handle it or
6	did you want me to make a ruling?
7	MS. JARVIS: It's admitted subject to
8	argument in the brief.
9	HEARING OFFICER WEBB: Okay.
10	MR. SHAW: So I give this to you?
11	HEARING OFFICER WEBB: You can give
12	it to me.
13	All right. Petitioner's Exhibit 1 is
14	admitted subject to post hearing arguments.
15	(Whereupon Petitioner's Exhibit 1
16	was admitted into evidence at
17	this time.)
18	MR. SHAW: We rest.
19	HEARING OFFICER WEBB: Okay. Thank
20	you, Mr. Johnson.
21	(Witness excused.)
22	MR. SHAW: If we could have a brief
23	recess just so I could confer with my clients.
24	HEARING OFFICER WEBB: Sure.

```
Page 30
                      Let's take five minutes.
 1
 2
                           (Recess taken)
 3
                      MS. JARVIS: Okay. We're ready to go
 4
       back on the record and we're going to call Michael
 5
       Piggush.
 6
                      HEARING OFFICER WEBB:
                                              All right.
                                                           We
 7
       are ready to go back on the record, and we are
 8
       picking up with Ms. Jarvis.
 9
                      Would you call your first witness,
10
       please.
11
                      MS. JARVIS: I call Michael Piggush.
                      HEARING OFFICER WEBB:
12
                                              Please have a
13
       seat, sir.
14
                      Would the court reporter please swear
       in the witness.
15
16
                           (Whereupon the witness was sworn
17
                           by the reporter.)
18
                          MICHAEL PIGGUSH
19
       called as a witness herein, on behalf of Respondent,
20
       having been first duly sworn on his oath, was
21
       examined and testified as follows:
22
                         DIRECT EXAMINATION
23
       BY MS. JARVIS:
24
              Q.
                      Please state your name.
```

		•
		Page 31
1	Α.	Michael Piggush.
2	Q.	And where are you employed?
3	Α.	At the Illinois EPA.
4	Q.	And what is your position?
5	Α.	Project manager for the leaking
6	underground st	orage tank section.
7	Q.	And how long have you been employed
8	at the in that	position?
9	Α.	25 years.
10	Q.	How long have you been employed at
11	the EPA?	
12	Α.	25 years.
13	Q.	So your entire time at the EPA has
14	been in the LU	ST Section?
15	Α.	Correct.
16	Q.	And how many LUST sites have you
17	reviewed over	that timeframe if you can take a
18	guesstimate?	
19	Α.	I would guesstimate maybe three or
20	four hundred.	
21	Q.	And are you the project manager on
22	the Benton Fir	e Department case?
23	Α.	Yes, I am.
24	Q.	And what was your involvement in that

```
Page 32
              What was your job in respect to the case?
 1
 2
                       I reviewed the information submitted
              Α.
 3
       by Chase Environmental.
 4
                       And then did you make a determination
              Q.
 5
       on that?
 6
              Α.
                      Right.
 7
                       Okay. I am going to show you pages 1
              Q.
 8
       through 9 of the record.
 9
                       Does that look familiar?
10
              Α.
                       It does.
11
                       And what is that document?
              Q.
12
                       This is the agency's decision letter
              Α.
13
       dated June 10, 2016.
14
                       Okay. And did you write that?
              0.
                      Yes, I did.
15
              Α.
                       And then what happens after you write
16
              0.
17
       a decision letter? Does it then go up management's
18
       chain?
19
                      Right. I give it to my boss, and he
              Α.
20
       reviews it and approves it.
21
                       And who is your supervisor?
              Q.
22
              Α.
                      My boss is Mike Lowder.
23
                       Okay. In reviewing this case, and
              Q.
24
       I'm going to show you page 10 which is on the back,
```

```
Page 33
       starting at page 10, is that a series of e-mail
 1
 2
       conversations or correspondence you had with Chase
       Environmental?
 3
              Α.
                       It is.
 4
 5
                       And who at Chase Environmental were
              0.
 6
       you corresponding with?
 7
                       Marvin Johnson.
              Α.
 8
                       Had you asked him questions about the
              Ο.
 9
       site?
10
              Α.
                       I did.
11
                       And what did those questions entail?
              Q.
12
                       Some of those were technical and some
              Α.
13
       of those were about the costs involved.
14
              0.
                       Okay. Did all the technical aspects
15
       get resolved?
16
                       Not yet, no.
17
              Q.
                       Okay. Going to what's under appeal
18
       in this case, which is the costs involved, what
19
       questions did you have concerning the costs?
20
                       I had questions about how did
       they...first, if the items were owned or rented and
21
22
       the materials cost, and if they were owned, then I
23
       wanted to know how they came up with those costs,
24
       and if they were rented, I wanted to know how they
```

		Page 34
1	came up with t	hose costs, and I had questions about
2	whether the co	sts were appropriate to be charged as
3	direct costs.	
4	Q.	Okay. Let's go through your first
5	question.	
6		You asked whether or not they were
7	rented or owne	d.
8	Α.	Correct.
9	Q.	Why did you ask that question?
10	Α.	Because it depends upon the
11	information th	at I would ask for subsequent to that.
12	Q.	So what type of information would you
13	ask for if it	was an owned item?
14	Α.	If it was for an owned item, I'd ask
15	them how did t	hey actually derive their own cost for
16	that item.	
17		Can I give an example to illustrate?
18	Q.	Sure.
19	Α.	For example, if an item costs a
20	thousand dolla	rs and it has a useful life of a
21	hundred days,	then, for example, it would make sense
22	that it costs	ten dollars a day to use it; or if
23	it's a rented	item, then I would like to see an
24	estimate from	the rental company as to how much do

```
Page 35
       they actually charge for it.
 1
 2
                       So you were looking for some sort of
              Q.
 3
       invoice from the rental company?
 4
              Α.
                       Right.
 5
              Q.
                       Okay.
 6
              Α.
                       Can I explain further?
 7
              Q.
                       Go ahead.
 8
              Α.
                       The purpose of that is to determine
 9
       reasonableness which is a matter of judgment, but
10
       that's why I asked for that.
11
                       And you used the phrase about a
              Q.
       derivation.
12
13
              Α.
                       Right.
14
              0.
                       What exactly were you looking for
15
       using that phrase and what was actually the reason
16
       you put that in there?
17
              Α.
                       What I was looking for is the same as
18
       the example I just gave. If an item cost a certain
19
       amount and has a certain usage, then it makes sense
20
       that it costs a certain unit rate for that item.
2.1
                       So that's the mathematical derivation
22
       you were talking about?
23
              Α.
                       Right.
24
                       Was that a type of analysis?
              Q.
```

L.A. Court Reporters, L.L.C. 312-419-9292

	Page 36
1	A. Right.
2	Q. Okay. And then I think the last
3	thing that you put, and correct me if I'm wrong if
4	there was something in between, was a question about
5	direct and indirect costs.
6	A. Right.
7	Q. Can you describe why you asked that
8	question?
9	A. A lot of the costs for equipment for
10	example for a PID meter or a measuring wheel or a
11	digital camera, in my judgment, those would be
12	considered to be indirect costs or what you would
13	call a tool of the trade.
14	If I can again illustrate by example.
15	If a plumber comes to your house and he fixes your
16	sink, he charges you for time and materials
17	typically. He doesn't charge you a rate for using
18	the pipe wrench, and in my judgment, I don't see how
19	the use of a tool such as a PID meter is any
20	different than the use of a pipe wrench.
21	Q. Okay.
22	A. And in that case then, I wouldn't
23	feel that the use of the tool would be reimbursable
24	as a direct cost.

```
Page 37
                       I'm going to back up because I forgot
 1
              Q.
 2
       to ask you a question at the beginning.
                      What is your educational background?
 3
 4
              Α.
                       I have a bachelor's degree in general
 5
       engineering.
 6
              Q.
                      Okay. And are you a professional
 7
       engineer?
 8
              Α.
                      No.
 9
              Q.
                      Okay. And where did you get that
10
       degree?
11
                      From the University of Illinois at
              Α.
12
       Urbana-Champaign.
13
              0.
                       Do you have any post undergraduate
14
       work?
15
              Α.
                      No, I do not.
                      Okay. So it's your professional
16
              Ο.
       judgment after spending 25 years that which types of
17
       items would be indirect costs?
18
19
                      For example, the PID meter or a
              Α.
20
       measuring wheel or a digital camera, those are costs
21
       that we typically see in budgets. I would question
22
       if they should be charged as direct costs.
23
              Q.
                      Okay. And can you just kind of
24
       explain the difference again between an indirect and
```

```
Page 38
       a direct cost?
 1
 2
              Α.
                      A direct cost would be, for example,
 3
       if you have to buy something that's expendable, for
 4
       example, a disposable bailer, you buy it, you use
 5
       it, and you throw it away. That's a cost that they
 6
       incurred directly, whereas the cost of, for example,
 7
       a PID meter, it's a tool of the trade that you have
 8
       to have to operate a business.
 9
                      MS. JARVIS: Okay. I have no further
10
       questions.
11
                                              Mr. Shaw?
                      HEARING OFFICER WEBB:
12
13
                          CROSS-EXAMINATION
14
       BY MR. SHAW:
15
                      Mr. Piggush, have you ever worked in
              Q.
16
       the private sector?
17
              Α.
                      No, I have not.
18
                      Were you involved in the City of
              Q.
19
       Benton project at the early action stage?
20
              Α.
                       I was, yes.
21
              Q.
                       In what capacity were you involved?
22
              Α.
                       I reviewed the 45 day report.
23
                      Did you review the early action
              Q.
24
       submittal or early action billing package submittal?
```

```
Page 39
 1
              Α.
                       No, I did not review bill packages.
 2
              0.
                       So it's possible that there were
 3
       reimbursements made at that stage that you may not
       agree with because they were made by somebody else?
 4
 5
                       It's possible, or that I wouldn't
 6
       even be aware of.
 7
              Q.
                       Did the EPA budget forms used to ask
 8
       whether or not the equipment was owned or rented?
 9
              Α.
                       I don't believe so.
10
                       Given your example of rental costs --
              Q.
       and you were here during all the testimony this
11
12
       morning, correct?
13
              Α.
                       Right.
14
              0.
                       With respect to your hypothetical
15
       about rental cost, would you consider a two to three
16
       day rental for a PID meter to be reasonable if it's
17
       only used for one day?
18
                       It could be.
              Α.
19
                       It could be?
              Q.
20
              Α.
                       Yeah.
21
              Q.
                       Given the explanation that was given
22
       that there may be transportation issues involved?
23
              Α.
                       Right, yeah.
24
                       Generally, if I understand correctly,
              Q.
```

```
Page 40
 1
       you weren't involved in the early action billing
 2
       part of that?
 3
                       No, I was not.
              Α.
 4
                       But generally you've been involved in
              Q.
 5
       budget reviews?
 6
              Α.
                       I have, yes.
              Q.
                       And this here is a budget review for
 8
       a site investigation actual budget document?
 9
              Α.
                       Correct.
10
              0.
                       What's the difference between a site
       investigation actual budget document and a
11
12
       non-actual budget?
13
                       The actual budget is submitted after
14
       the costs were incurred as opposed to a
15
       budget-budget is submitted for pre-approval
       beforehand.
16
17
              0.
                       And for site investigation Stage I,
18
       does the Agency accept budgets at that point that
19
       are not actual budgets?
20
              Α.
                       Do you mean do we accept --
21
              Q.
                       Proposed budgets.
22
              Α.
                       We don't typically see them.
23
                       Isn't it true that the EPA documents
              Q.
2.4
       indicate that the consultant is supposed to submit
```

```
Page 41
       an actual cost budget, not a proposed budget?
 1
 2
              Α.
                       That's probably true.
 3
                       For how long have you been involved
              0.
       in reviewing budgets?
 4
 5
                       Ever since there's been budgets which
 6
       I don't recall offhand how long that's been.
 7
              Q.
                       Since at least probably the mid '90s?
 8
              Α.
                       Probably.
 9
                       Have you ever approved a budget for a
              Q.
10
       PID meter?
11
                       Yeah, sure.
              Α.
                       When did you first approve a budget
12
              Ο.
13
       item for a PID meter?
14
                       Probably since there's been budgets.
15
              0.
                       Now, you've indicated that you
16
       believe this is something that is now a tool of the
17
       trade.
18
                       What had changed?
19
                       What had changed is our management
              Α.
20
       has changed, and the agency's directive is now to do
       things differently.
21
22
              Q.
                       So prior to the management change,
23
       did you ask for invoices for PID meters?
2.4
              Α.
                       No.
```

```
Page 42
 1
              Q.
                      How would a photocopy be a tool of
 2.
       the trade?
 3
                      A photocopy would not be a tool of
              Α.
 4
       the trade.
 5
                      There was some discussion earlier
              Q.
 6
       about agreed rates being entered into.
 7
                      Why did you not propose agreed rates?
 8
              Α.
                      I was not aware of what the agreed
 9
       rates were.
10
                      Have you subsequently been involved
              Q.
11
       in doing that?
12
                      No, I have not.
13
                      MR. SHAW: I don't have any further
14
       questions.
15
                      HEARING OFFICER WEBB: Ms. Jarvis?
16
                      MS. JARVIS: I have no questions.
17
                      HEARING OFFICER WEBB:
                                              Okay.
                                                      Thank
18
       you, Mr. Piggush.
19
                           (Witness excused.)
20
                      HEARING OFFICER WEBB: Ms. Jarvis,
       would you like to call another witness?
21
22
                      MS. JARVIS: No. That's all.
                                                       The
23
       Illinois EPA rests.
2.4
                      HEARING OFFICER WEBB: All right.
```

L.A. Court Reporters, L.L.C. 312-419-9292

	Page 43
1	Would you like to introduce your exhibits?
2	MS. JARVIS: Yes.
3	I would like to ask that Exhibits 1
4	and 2 of the respondent be entered into evidence.
5	HEARING OFFICER WEBB: These are in
6	the record, right?
7	MS. JARVIS: No.
8	HEARING OFFICER WEBB: Oh, these are
9	not in the record?
10	MS. JARVIS: Those are not in the
11	record.
12	MR. SHAW: We object. They are post
13	decision letters involving an entirely different
14	case. There's no relevance to them here.
15	HEARING OFFICER WEBB: Post decision
16	involving what?
17	MR. SHAW: They're post decision
18	letters. They postdate the decision under appeal
19	here, and they have no relevance to the case.
20	MS. JARVIS: However, the petitioner
21	himself brought up other cases and other agreements
22	with other rates and the consistency of the Agency
23	in accepting things, so this is just an example to
24	show that other rates have been accepted either in

```
Page 44
 1
       the future or in the past.
 2
                      HEARING OFFICER WEBB:
                                              I will take,
 3
       because they're post decision, I'm going to take
 4
       them as an offer of proof.
 5
                      MS. JARVIS:
                                    Okay.
 6
                      HEARING OFFICER WEBB:
                                              Both of them,
 7
       Respondent's Exhibits 1 and 2, are taken as offers
 8
       of proof.
 9
                      Okay. Let's go off the record for a
10
       moment to discuss a briefing schedule.
11
                           (Discussion held off the record.)
12
                      HEARING OFFICER WEBB:
                                              Okay.
13
       back on the record.
14
                      The transcript is due by
       October 25th.
                      I think I said November 1st.
15
                                                      It's
16
       October 25th.
                      That's five business days.
17
                      The public comment deadline is
18
       November 1st. Public comment must be filed in
19
       accordance with Section 101.628 of the Board's
20
       procedural rules.
21
                       The petitioner's brief is due by
22
       November 13th, respondent's brief is due by
       November 28th, and petitioner's reply is due by
23
2.4
       December 5th.
```

```
Page 45
                      Do either of you wish to make a
 1
 2
       closing argument?
 3
                      Mr. Shaw.
 4
                      MR. SHAW: I'll reserve that for the
 5
       briefs.
 6
                      HEARING OFFICER WEBB: Ms. Jarvis?
 7
                      MS. JARVIS: I will likewise reserve
       it for the briefs.
 8
 9
                      HEARING OFFICER WEBB: Okay. At this
10
       time I will conclude the proceedings. We stand
11
       adjourned, and I thank everyone for their
12
       participation.
13
                           (Which were all of the
14
                           proceedings held at this time.)
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
```

```
Page 46
       STATE OF ILLINOIS )
 1
                          )SS.
 2
       COUNTY OF SANGAMON)
 3
 4
                             CERTIFICATE
 5
               I, Laurel A. Patkes, Certified Shorthand
 6
       Reporter in and for said County and State, do hereby
       certify that I reported in shorthand the foregoing
 8
       proceedings and that the foregoing is a true and
 9
       correct transcript of my shorthand notes so taken as
10
       aforesaid.
11
               I further certify that I am in no way
12
       associated with or related to any of the parties or
13
       attorneys involved herein, nor am I financially
14
       interested in this action.
15
               Dated October 21, 2017.
16
17
                            Certified Shorthand Reporter
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
```

	N 07.14.20.7	20.10	14.21.22	1 . 22 10
A	allow 27:14 28:7	20:18	44:21,22	chain 32:18
<b>a.m</b> 1:11 4:5	<b>amount</b> 15:8	attainment 7:18	briefing 44:10	change 41:22
able 20:14,22	35:19	Attorney 2:3	<b>briefs</b> 45:5,8	changed 41:18
accept 21:14	analysis 35:24	attorneys 46:13	brought 43:21	41:19,20
22:14 40:18,20	answer 19:8	<b>Avenue</b> 1:12 2:8	<b>budget</b> 9:1	charge 35:1
acceptable	22:19 23:9	aware 10:10	25:21 27:1,16	36:17
15:15	<b>appeal</b> 22:3,7,15	14:23 39:6	39:7 40:5,7,8	charged 9:9
accepted 26:22	24:1 25:24	42:8	40:11,12,13	15:4,8 17:12
43:24	33:17 43:18		41:1,1,9,12	34:2 37:22
accepting 43:23	appealed 22:11	$\frac{\mathbf{B}}{\mathbf{B}}$	budget-budget	charges 36:16
act 5:1	appearances 2:1	<b>B</b> 13:20	40:15	<b>Chase</b> 7:5 8:17
action 9:5 10:23	5:5	Bachelor 7:19	budgets 18:8	9:21,24 10:7
10:24 11:4	appearing 2:5,9	bachelor's 37:4	37:21 40:18,19	18:2 24:16
38:19,23,24	appears 15:11	back 25:3,4 30:4	40:21 41:4,5	26:12 32:3
40:1 46:14	appointed 1:13	30:7 32:24	41:14	33:2,5
actual 10:19	appropriate	37:1 44:13	business 12:15	choice 20:2
40:8,11,13,19	17:11 34:2	background	38:8 44:16	21:13
41:1	approval 21:24	37:3	<b>buy</b> 38:3,4	chose 23:4
additional 10:17	22:6	bailer 38:4		City 1:4 4:4 5:7
21:21 22:15	approve 20:1	bankrupt 16:1	<u> </u>	6:24 24:3
23:1,20	21:16 41:12	<b>Based</b> 13:3,10	call 5:24 6:2	38:18
adjourned 45:11	approved 13:7	beginning 4:5	17:3 30:4,9,11	clear 4:17 17:5,8
admit 28:10	18:8 26:3 27:1	37:2	36:13 42:21	clerk 4:23
admitted 3:15	41:9	behalf 2:5,9 5:6	called 6:15	client's 18:8
27:14 29:7,14	approves 32:20	5:8 6:15 30:19	12:10 30:19	clients 24:21
29:16	approximately	believe 10:23	camera 26:17	29:23
aforesaid 46:10	7:11 11:21	12:2,7,13	27:2 36:11	closing 45:2
<b>Agency</b> 1:7 4:20	<b>April</b> 27:18	19:23 20:9,16	37:20	come 6:5 24:15
5:9 7:7 9:3	argument 28:11	20:21 21:18	capacity 38:21	<b>comes</b> 36:15
10:5 13:8	28:13 29:8	24:21 26:24	career 8:21	<b>coming</b> 24:10
24:12 40:18	45:2	28:5 39:9	Carol 1:13 4:3	comment 4:22
43:22	arguments	41:16	case 4:8,15	4:22 44:17,18
agency's 4:10	29:14	Bellerive 2:3	10:10 15:8,11	<b>company</b> 12:5,8
32:12 41:20	asked 12:7	<b>Benton</b> 1:4 4:4	20:7 25:13	12:9 16:14,22
agree 27:14	18:10 19:17	4:13 5:7 6:24	26:7,22 27:7	17:4 23:24
28:10 39:4	21:12 22:20	24:3 25:13	31:22 32:1,1	34:24 35:3
agreed 15:9	33:8 34:6	31:22 38:19	32:23 33:18	competing 10:1
19:18,20 24:16	35:10 36:7	<b>bill</b> 39:1	36:22 43:14,19	completion
24:17 42:6,7,8	asking 11:20	billable 11:24	cases 22:12	10:19,21,24
agreement	aspect 15:1	billing 27:16	43:21	11:13
15:13 29:5	aspects 11:12	38:24 40:1	<b>certain</b> 35:18,19	concerned 23:15
	14:24 33:14	biology 7:21	35:20	concerning 14:8
agreements 43:21	assistant 2:7	<b>Board</b> 1:2 4:14	CERTIFICA	33:19
ahead 26:21	8:11	<b>Board's</b> 5:1,3	46:4	concerns 25:21
28:19 35:7	associated 9:6	44:19	Certified 46:5	conclude 45:10
<b>Albarricin</b> 15:7	46:12	boss 32:19,22	46:17	concrete 26:8
AIDAITICIII 13./	Assuming 20:13	<b>brief</b> 29:8,22	<b>certify</b> 46:7,11	conduct 4:15
	20.13	ĺ	<b>.</b>	
-				

	I	ı	ı	
conducted 5:1	25:6,20 33:22	26:14,19,22,23	18:11,13,16	43:4
confer 29:23	34:15 35:18	27:1,4,7	20:1 23:21	entire 22:4
confusing 28:19	36:24 38:1,2,5	Department 1:4	24:13 27:8	31:13
consider 39:15	38:6 39:15	4:4 5:7 6:24	documents 9:1,2	entirely 43:13
considered	41:1	31:22	24:9,10 40:23	environmental
36:12	costs 9:8,9 25:14	depends 34:10	doing 42:11	1:6 5:9 7:6,21
consistency	25:16 26:2	derivation 12:21	dollar 21:20	8:18 9:2 10:4
43:22	33:13,18,19,23	13:1 17:18	dollars 21:19	12:13 32:3
consistent 13:6	34:1,2,3,19,22	35:12,21	23:17 24:2	33:3,5
consistently	35:20 36:5,9	<b>derive</b> 34:15	34:20,22	<b>EPA</b> 12:11 18:4
18:8	36:12 37:18,20	describe 10:12	drill 24:23	19:24 20:3
consultant 10:8	37:22 39:10	36:7	due 25:20 44:14	21:15 31:3,11
40:24	40:14	determination	44:21,22,23	31:13 39:7
consultants 9:14	Counsel 2:7	32:4	duly 1:13 6:16	40:23 42:23
9:17,22,23	County 4:7 46:2	determine 10:16	30:20	EPA's 17:5
10:1	46:6	12:8 35:8		equipment 16:9
consulting 4:11	court 6:6 30:14	determined	E	25:3 36:9 39:8
9:7,8 11:14	CROSS 3:2	12:12 16:23	<b>E</b> 3:1	estimate 16:14
13:6 18:7	CROSS-EXA	17:19	e-mail 11:6,10	16:21 34:24
contact 12:7	14:1 38:13	developing 9:12	11:17,18,19	estimated 17:21
contacted 16:8	CSR 1:24	difference 37:24	12:4 14:6,7,10	17:22
context 19:19	cut 22:16 23:15	40:10	15:12,13 18:14	estimation 25:5
Control 1:2 4:14		different 36:20	18:15,20 20:10	evening 20:11
conversations	D	43:13	22:18 33:1	20:11
33:2	<b>D</b> 3:1	differently	e-mails 14:3	evidence 27:14
correct 12:18	date 12:19,23	41:21	15:6 16:7	29:16 43:4
15:4,10,15,16	24:4 27:19	difficulties 11:3	19:18,23 20:14	exactly 21:23
15:19 16:11,15	28:3 29:3	digital 26:17	20:15	35:14
17:2 18:12,18	dated 32:13	27:2 36:11	earlier 42:5	EXAMINATI
18:22 19:2	46:15	37:20	early 11:4 38:19	6:19 19:15
22:10,12 23:3	day 34:22 38:22	direct 3:2 6:19	38:23,24 40:1	23:12 30:22
25:18 26:6	39:16,17	17:12,14 30:22	East 1:12 2:8	examined 6:17
31:15 34:8	days 34:21	34:3 36:5,24	Eastern 7:20	30:21
36:3 39:12	44:16	37:22 38:1,2	educational 7:17	example 24:22
40:9 46:9	deadline 4:18	directive 41:20	37:3	34:17,19,21
corrective 9:5	20:12 44:17	directly 38:6	either 43:24	35:18 36:10,14
10:23,24	December 44:24	discuss 5:12	45:1	37:19 38:2,4,6
correctly 39:24	<b>decision</b> 4:15,18	17:11 44:10	Elston 15:7	39:10 43:23
correspondence	20:12 27:21,23	discussion 24:12	employ 9:24	excused 29:21
7:6 33:2	28:1 32:12,17	42:5 44:11	10:3	42:19
corresponding	43:13,15,17,18	disposable 38:4	employed 31:2,7	Exhibit 3:16
33:6	44:3	disputing 23:15	31:10	15:18 28:18,20
cost 4:11 10:19	<b>degree</b> 37:4,10	dissolution 16:3	engineer 37:7	28:22 29:1,13
16:13,21 17:20	delivered 24:24	DOCKET 1:5	engineering	29:15
17:21 18:17	denial 4:10	document 14:19	37:5	exhibits 3:14,17
19:1,7,10	denied 22:12	32:11 40:8,11	<b>entail</b> 33:11	13:18,23 43:1
23:23 25:2,3,5	25:14,17,22	documentation	entered 42:6	43:3 44:7
	<u> </u>		<u> </u>	

	22.14		:1 0.10	10.15
existing 18:4	22:14	guess 8:22 11:23	idea 8:19	10:15
expendable 38:3	<b>foregoing</b> 46:7,8	guesstimate	identification	instructions
experience 13:3	forgot 37:1	31:18,19	13:24 29:2	18:4 27:15
13:10	forms 18:4,7	H	IDENTIFIED	interest 4:8
explain 12:6	27:16 39:7	<b>h</b> 12:1	3:15	interested 46:14
23:18 35:6	found 24:15	half 22:6	IEPA 2:7 4:4	introduce 43:1
37:24	four 31:20	handed 27:15	Illinois 1:2,6,12	investigation
explanation	Franklin 4:7	handle 29:5	2:4,8 5:9 7:20	4:12 10:11,13
39:21	Friday 20:12,15	happen 9:19	8:4 9:2 10:4	10:14,18,21
extension 22:22	20:20	10:22	18:4 21:15	11:13 24:4,6
23:1,3,5,20	fund 24:22	happens 9:20	31:3 37:11	40:8,11,17
extort 21:15	further 13:14	32:16	42:23 46:1	invoice 35:3
	19:12 21:5	hearing 1:10,13	Illinois' 25:21	invoices 18:17
facility 4:7	23:6 25:7,8	4:2,3,9,16,24	illustrate 34:17	18:21,23 20:19
familiar 6:23	27:10 35:6	5:10,15,20,23	36:14	20:19 21:1
7:3 9:8,11,23	38:9 42:13	6:4,12 13:16	impacted 10:17	41:23
32:9	46:11	13:21 15:17	<b>include</b> 17:19	involve 8:24
fear 23:19	future 44:1	21:8 27:11	18:1	involved 7:12
fee 21:14	G	28:21 29:4,9	included 17:24	8:21 10:15
feel 36:23	general 37:4	29:11,14,19,24	18:2	33:13,18 38:18
field 20:22	generally 39:24	30:6,12 38:11	including 17:20 incurred 38:6	38:21 39:22
file 23:20	40:4	42:15,17,20,24		40:1,4 41:3
filed 4:22 44:18	getting 23:16	43:5,8,15 44:2	40:14	42:10 46:13
filing 22:15 24:1	give 5:16 18:11	44:6,12 45:6,9	indicate 10:22	involvement
final 4:14	23:2,4,8 29:10	held 1:10 44:11	40:24	31:24 involves 10:11
financial 12:20	29:11 32:19	45:14	indicated 19:23 41:15	
12:24 17:18	34:17	help 12:17 14:11	indicates 12:5	involving 7:14 43:13,16
financially	given 20:6 39:10	Hernando 15:7	20:9	43.13,10 issue 4:10
46:13	39:21,21	highest 7:17	indicating 23:14	issues 24:18
find 20:14,18	go 23:23 25:1	historically 13:7	indirect 17:14	39:22
fine 22:21 28:22	26:21 28:19	hold 4:9	36:5,12 37:18	item 16:13,20,22
Fire 1:4 4:4 5:7	30:3,7 32:17	<b>holding</b> 21:17	37:24	16:24 17:4,6
6:24 31:22	34:4 35:7 44:9	21:20	individuals 9:21	17:12,17,19
firm 15:9,24	goes 7:7	hoping 25:24	Industries 8:3,5	19:1 34:13,14
16:3	going 13:17 14:3	hour 1:11 12:2	15:21,23	34:16,19,23
first 5:24 6:16	18:1 22:17	hours 11:23	industry 9:9	35:18,20 41:13
7:22 30:9,20	24:23 27:13,17	14:18	information	items 20:20
33:21 34:4	28:13 30:4	house 36:15	12:10,14 17:24	23:16 27:6
41:12	32:7,24 33:17	hundred 21:19	18:3 20:23,24	33:21 37:18
<b>five</b> 30:1 44:16	37:1 44:3	21:20 23:17	22:23 23:2	
fixes 36:15	<b>Good</b> 4:2	24:2 31:20	26:8,11,16	J
follow-up 21:7	gotten 22:1,5,6	34:21	32:2 34:11,12	January 7:24
followed 20:13	<b>Grand</b> 1:12 2:8	hypothetical	initial 9:4	<b>Jarvis</b> 2:7 3:4,6
follows 6:17	granted 4:8	39:14	initially 9:13	5:8,8,13,20,21
30:21	groundwater		inquiry 11:16	13:16,17 14:2
<b>force</b> 21:16	10:16	I	installation	15:19 19:12
	<u> </u>	<u> </u>		

21:7,11 23:6	look 32:9	measuring	normal 19:7	44:12 45:9
25:8,12 27:10	looking 8:13	36:10 37:20	normally 15:4	once 9:20
27:17,20,23	35:2,14,17	Melanie 2:7 5:8	North 4:13	opening 5:16,18
28:3,7,12,15	lot 8:6 36:9	27:13	notes 6:11 46:9	5:22
29:7 30:3,8,11	Lowder 28:5	members 4:14	<b>notice</b> 1:10	operate 38:8
30:23 38:9	32:22	4:21	noticed 4:24	operation 17:21
42:15,16,20,22	lower 19:21	memorize 11:20	November 4:23	opportunities
43:2,7,10,20	LUST 7:15	mentions 15:13	44:15,18,22,23	9:16
44:5 45:6,7	31:14,16	meter 36:10,19		opportunity
job 25:6 32:1		37:19 38:7	0	23:9
<b>Johnson</b> 3:3 6:3	M	39:16 41:10,13	oath 6:16 30:20	opposed 40:14
6:4,14,22,23	maintenance	meters 41:23	<b>object</b> 27:17	option 20:6
19:17 29:20	17:21 21:2	Michael 3:5	28:13 43:12	22:24
33:7	<b>major</b> 7:20	30:4,11,18	objection 28:8	options 22:13
judgment 35:9	management	31:1	obligations 21:3	order 23:1 26:23
36:11,18 37:17	41:19,22	mid 41:7	October 1:11	orderly 4:16
June 4:18 11:7	management's	Mike 32:22	4:5 27:20 28:6	outloud 16:19
28:2 32:13	32:17	minute 6:10	44:15,16 46:15	owned 17:17
justifying 24:14	manager 7:4	minutes 30:1	offer 44:4	33:21,22 34:7
Justifying 24.14	8:12,12,13	moment 44:10	offers 44:7	34:13,14 39:8
K	12:3 31:5,21	<b>Monday</b> 20:10	offhand 41:6	ownership
<b>Kathy</b> 15:7,12	managers 8:14	20:11 24:24	<b>Officer</b> 1:13 4:2	24:19
kind 37:23	manner 4:16	money 12:15	5:10,15,20,23	owning 24:20
know 12:12	<b>Maple</b> 4:13	22:1 24:21,22	6:4,12 13:16	owning 24.20
19:10 26:20	mark 28:19	monitoring	13:21 15:17	P
33:23,24	marked 13:19	10:16	21:8 27:11	package 22:4
known 4:8	13:24 29:2	morning 4:2	28:21 29:4,9	23:17 24:1
	marking 28:17	39:12	29:11,19,24	25:4,23 26:3
L	<b>Marvin</b> 3:3 6:2	moved 8:12	30:6,12 38:11	38:24
L.A 1:22	6:14,22 33:7	<b>multiple</b> 7:8 9:1	42:15,17,20,24	packages 39:1
<b>Laurel</b> 1:24 46:5	material 9:7,8	19:5	43:5,8,15 44:2	page 14:12
Law 2:3	25:16	17.5	44:6,12 45:6,9	16:17 17:16
leaking 8:6	materials 4:11	N	<b>Oh</b> 17:13 43:8	22:17 32:24
13:11 31:5	9:14 11:14	N 1:12 2:8 3:1	okay 5:15,23	33:1
leave 25:1	13:6 18:7	name 4:3 6:21	6:12 7:8,22 8:1	pages 32:7
<b>left</b> 16:5	33:22 36:16	30:24	14:4,5,22 15:2	paid 23:16 24:4
Let's 30:1 34:4	mathematical	nature 8:9 10:12	15:6 16:17	25:19 26:4
44:9	12:20,24 17:18	necessary 10:18	17:9,23 18:24	part 4:11 12:4
letter 27:3 32:12	35:21	need 6:10 13:17	21:8,12 22:21	40:2
32:17	matter 23:23	22:22	26:7 27:6 28:7	partial 21:24
letters 43:13,18	35:9	neighborhood	28:16 29:9,19	participation
life 17:22 34:20	matters 5:11	8:22	30:3 32:7,14	45:12
likewise 45:7	Mattoon 21:18	neutral 4:16	32:23 33:14,17	parties 5:4
<b>list</b> 16:10	26:7	never 23:22	34:4 35:5 36:2	46:12
<b>located</b> 4:7,13	mean 21:24 28:9	24:16	36:21 37:6,9	parties' 4:9
<b>long</b> 31:7,10	28:13 40:20	non-actual	37:16,23 38:9	Patkes 1:24 46:5
41:3,6	meant 22:16	40:12	42:17 44:5,9	<b>Patrick</b> 2:2 5:6
			ĺ	

			11 20	20.14
paving 26:9	possibly 23:20	provided 18:13	really 11:20	relevance 28:14
payment 22:7	27:2	public 4:8,21	reason 35:15	43:14,19
PCB 1:5 4:3	post 29:14 37:13	44:17,18	reasonable	remediation 7:1
people 4:20 9:24	43:12,15,17	purchase 17:20	13:12 15:3	7:23
10:3	44:3	purpose 4:15	39:16	remember 10:15
percent 25:5	postdate 43:18	35:8	reasonableness	26:10,15 27:4
personnel 25:14	pre-approval	pursuant 1:10	35:9	rent 25:6
25:20 26:2	40:15	4:24 5:2 12:1	recall 11:2,8	rental 12:5,8,9
petitioner 1:4	preliminary	put 12:11 35:16	41:6	16:14,21,22
2:5 6:15 43:20	5:11	36:3	receipts 17:20	17:4 24:15,17
petitioner's 3:16	preparing 11:22	Q	18:17	24:18 34:24
4:12 28:18,20	present 4:21,21		receive 20:1	35:3 39:10,15
28:21 29:1,13	<b>prior</b> 12:19 16:5	quality 10:16	received 11:6	39:16
29:15 44:21,23	41:22	<b>question</b> 16:12 16:18,19 17:5	12:20,24 20:10	rented 16:10,13
photocopy 42:1	private 38:16		recess 29:23	16:20 17:1,4,6
42:3	probably 7:13	17:8,10,13,15 21:13 22:19,20	30:2	24:22 33:21,24
phrase 35:11,15	13:21 14:11		recollection 28:6	34:7,23 39:8
PIB 15:8	25:20 41:2,7,8	34:5,9 36:4,8	record 4:6,17	renting 25:3
picking 30:8	41:14	37:2,21	5:5,12 11:20	repeat 11:21
<b>PID</b> 19:3,7,10	procedural 5:3	questions 11:11 11:14 13:15	14:13 16:18	replied 11:17
24:20,23 26:23	44:20		17:16 20:9	reply 44:23
36:10,19 37:19	proceedings 4:1	14:15,16 19:13	22:18 30:4,7	report 9:5 10:19
38:7 39:16	4:17 45:10,14	21:6 23:7,10	32:8 43:6,9,11	10:22,24 11:13
41:10,13,23	46:8	25:7,9 27:10	44:9,11,13	38:22
PIDs 19:9	product 17:22	33:8,11,19,20 34:1 38:10	RECROSS 3:2	reported 46:7
Piggush 3:5 11:7	professional		RECROSS-E	reporter 1:24
14:6 20:7,10	37:6,16	42:14,16	21:10 25:11	6:6,9 30:14,17
22:18 30:5,11	program 7:15	R	REDIRECT 3:2	46:6,17
30:18 31:1	8:6,7 13:4,5,11	rate 11:24 15:1	19:15 23:12	REPORTING
38:15 42:18	project 7:1 8:11	15:9,14 16:22	referenced 21:1	1:22
pipe 36:18,20	8:12,13,14	17:19 22:14	reflected 24:19	request 4:9
plan 4:12 9:5	12:3 17:21	24:14,16,17,18	refused 18:11	12:20 18:9
10:23	31:5,21 38:19	35:20 36:17	23:2	21:18,21
planning 9:1	projects 8:20	rates 9:13,14,17	regarding 11:14	requested 12:10
please 5:5 6:5,6	10:7	9:23 12:9,13	14:15 19:18	19:21
16:13,20 17:9	proof 44:4,8	13:5,12 14:8	regulations 12:1	requests 9:6,15
17:11,17 22:19	property 10:13	14:16,20,21	reimbursable	12:24
30:10,12,14,24	10:15	15:3 18:6,7	36:23	required 18:3
<b>plumber</b> 36:15	propose 42:7	19:18,19 24:14	reimbursement	reserve 45:4,7
plus 22:11	proposed 18:6	42:6,7,9 43:22	9:6,15 11:3	resolved 26:1
point 23:22	40:21 41:1	43:24	18:9 20:2	33:15
40:18	<b>Protection</b> 1:7	reach 29:4	21:18,21 27:3	respect 9:7 32:1
Pollution 1:2	5:9 9:2 10:5	read 16:18 17:7	reimbursements	39:14
4:14	provide 12:14	17:9 22:19	39:3	responded 18:14
position 31:4,8	16:13,21 17:18	ready 22:23	Reis 12:13 16:8	18:15,19,20
possible 22:9	18:16 23:20	30:3,7	related 8:7	respondent 1:7
27:6,9 39:2,5	24:13		46:12	2:10 30:19
	•	•	•	

				1 age 32
43:4	seat 30:13	40:8,10,17	38:24,24	15:2 30:21
respondent's	section 31:6,14	sites 7:9,11,14	submittals 9:1	testimony 39:11
3:17 13:23	44:19	19:5 31:16	19:22	thank 5:10
15:18 44:7,22	Sections 5:2	small 23:16	submitted 10:20	29:19 42:17
response 11:15	sector 38:16	soil 10:17	11:1 13:12	45:11
11:18,19,22	see 14:10 34:23	somebody 24:15	24:8,11 25:23	thing 19:1 36:3
12:4 14:24	36:18 37:21	25:3 39:4	26:3 32:2	things 21:2
15:14 17:23	40:22	sorry 17:13,16	40:13,15	26:21 41:21
18:2	seeing 16:16	sort 10:11 18:24	subpart 12:1	43:23
responses 16:7	27:3	35:2	subsequent	think 14:23
rest 14:16 22:23	send 25:4	sound 22:10	34:11	19:17 20:19
29:18	senior 8:12 12:3	sounds 12:16	subsequently	23:24 36:2
rests 42:23	sense 23:24	spend 11:22	42:10	44:15
result 23:16	34:21 35:19	14:19	successful 23:22	thought 18:19
review 7:6 9:14	sent 14:6 20:11	spending 37:17	supervisor	thousand 21:19
9:15,16 19:18	series 33:1	Springfield 1:12	32:21	21:20 23:17
27:5 38:23	serve 7:4	2:4,8 4:9	supervisory	24:2 34:20
39:1 40:7	Service 1:22	<b>SS</b> 46:1	8:13	three 9:21 11:23
reviewed 31:17	15:20	stage 4:11 10:19	<b>supply</b> 18:21,24	14:18 31:19
32:2 38:22	services 7:5	11:4 38:19	supporting	39:15
reviewing 32:23	<b>Shaw</b> 2:2 3:4,6	39:3 40:17	18:11,16 27:8	throw 38:5
41:4	5:6,6,14,16,18	stand 45:10	supposed 40:24	tickets 26:8
reviews 32:20	5:24 6:2,10,20	start 7:22 14:3	sure 10:10 16:16	till 25:1
40:5	13:14 19:16	started 8:11	17:7 19:8	time 5:4 8:2
<b>right</b> 7:12 18:20	21:5,12 23:8	10:8 28:17	29:24 34:18	11:21 14:19,20
22:20 29:13	23:13 25:7	starting 33:1	41:11	14:21 17:3,8
30:6 32:6,19	27:11,12,19,21	state 6:21 16:9	swear 6:6 30:14	18:5 20:23
35:4,13,23	28:1,9,14,16	25:20 30:24	sworn 6:8,16	22:22,24 23:3
36:1,6 39:13	29:10,18,22	46:1,6	30:16,20	23:4 29:17
39:23 42:24	38:11,14 42:13	statement 5:17		31:13 36:16
43:6	43:12,17 45:3	5:19,22	<u>T</u>	45:10,14
role 8:13	45:4	<b>stating</b> 12:10,15	take 10:7 22:16	timeframe 31:17
rule 20:3	shipping 25:2	status 15:24	30:1 31:17	times 10:3 23:21
rules 5:1,3 44:20	shorthand 46:5	stickers 13:18	44:2,3	24:9
ruling 29:6	46:7,9,17	storage 6:24 7:5	taken 30:2 44:7	told 19:24
<u> </u>	show 16:17 20:3	7:23 8:6,7,20	46:9	tool 36:13,19,23
S 2000 10.17	22:17 32:7,24	13:4,5,11 31:6	talked 12:5	38:7 41:16
sampling 10:17	43:24	Street 4:13	talking 35:22	42:1,3
SANGAMON	shows 25:1	strike 20:17	tank 7:1,5,23	trade 36:13 38:7
46:2	SICR 11:12	subject 28:8,10	8:6,7,20 13:4,5	41:17 42:2,4
save 24:21,21	side 9:12	29:7,14	13:11 31:6	transcript 44:14
says 15:14	sink 36:16	submit 22:22	technical 11:12	46:9
schedule 44:10 School 21:18	sir 30:13	23:1 26:8,11	14:7,16,20,24	transportation
Science 7:19 8:3	site 4:12,12	26:16 27:7	33:12,14 <b>tell</b> 19:1	39:22
8:5 9:13 15:22	10:11,12,14,18	40:24	ten 19.1 ten 20:20 34:22	tried 20:14
15:23	10:21 11:12	submittal 10:11	testified 6:17	24:13
13.43	24:4,6 33:9	13:6 18:5	testifica 0.1/	true 21:23 40:23
	•	•	•	•

Page 53

	1	1	1	rage 55
41:2 46:8	wait 24:24	wouldn't 36:22	<b>18</b> 1:11	22:14 24:1,14
try 21:21	waive 5:18,21	39:5	<b>18th</b> 4:5	26:23
trying 12:11	want 12:16	wrench 36:18,20	<b>19/23</b> 3:4	
Tuesday 24:23	14:10 23:8,22	write 16:24	1st 4:23 44:15	8
two 14:15 15:6	29:5,6	32:14,16	44:18	<b>80</b> 2:3 7:13
19:20 39:15	wanted 12:12	written 4:22		
<b>type</b> 24:10 34:12	23:2 33:23,24	16:13,21	2	9
35:24	way 21:16 46:11	wrong 17:13	<b>2</b> 3:17 13:20,22	9 11:7 32:8
types 19:9 37:17	<b>We'll</b> 17:13	36:3	13:23 17:15	<b>90s</b> 41:7
typically 36:17	we're 24:23 30:3		43:4 44:7	
37:21 40:22	30:4 44:12	X	<b>2000</b> 7:24	
	Webb 1:13 4:2,3	<b>X</b> 3:1	<b>2009</b> 27:18	
U	5:10,15,20,23		<b>2016</b> 11:7 27:20	
undergraduate	6:4,12 13:16	Y	28:2 32:13	
7:5 8:20 37:13	13:21 15:17	<b>yeah</b> 14:11	<b>2017</b> 1:11 46:15	
underground	21:8 27:11	39:20,23 41:11	<b>2018</b> 4:19	
6:24 7:23 8:6,7	28:21 29:4,9	year 9:20 19:20	<b>21</b> 4:18 46:15	
13:4,5,11 31:6	29:11,19,24	years 31:9,12	<b>21/25</b> 3:4	
understand	30:6,12 38:11	37:17	<b>25</b> 31:9,12 37:17	
39:24	42:15,17,20,24		<b>25th</b> 44:15,16	
unit 17:19 35:20	43:5,8,15 44:2	Z	<b>28th</b> 44:23	
United 8:3,5	44:6,12 45:6,9	zero 20:2	<b>29</b> 3:16,16	
9:13 15:20,22	Wednesday 1:10	0		
University 7:20	week 20:21,22		3	
37:11	wells 10:16	<b>084-001340</b> 1:24	<b>30</b> 3:6	
updated 27:18	went 16:1	1	312)419-9292	
27:19	weren't 22:14	13:16,17 13:20	1:23	
Urbana-Cha	40:1		<b>38</b> 3:6	
37:12	wheel 36:10	13:21,23 15:18		
usage 17:22	37:20	17:16 28:20,22	4	
35:19	wish 45:1	29:1,13,15	<b>4:30</b> 20:11	
use 19:5 34:22		32:7 43:3 44:7	<b>45</b> 38:22	
36:19,20,23	witness 3:2 6:1,7	10 4:5 14:12	<b>4A1</b> 17:16	
38:4	6:8,15,21 23:9	17:16 32:13,24		
useful 24:9	29:21 30:9,15	33:1	5	
34:20	30:16,19 42:19	10:00 1:11	<b>50</b> 25:5	
USI 8:10,15	42:21	101.600 5:2	<b>500</b> 8:23	
usually 8:24	Woodlawn 8:4	<b>101.628</b> 44:19	<b>5th</b> 44:24	
usually 0.24	work 8:1,7,9,16	<b>101.632</b> 5:2		
$\overline{\mathbf{V}}$	10:1,4,13,14	<b>1021</b> 1:11 2:8	6	
variables 17:20	10:19 15:20	<b>107</b> 4:13	63:4	
various 19:21	16:2 24:4 25:1	<b>11</b> 14:12 16:17	60 21:22	
vehicle 26:12,24	37:14	<b>125</b> 12:2	<b>62704</b> 2:4	
versus 4:4	worked 9:22	<b>13</b> 3:17 22:17	<b>62794</b> 2:8	
vs- 1:5	38:15	<b>135</b> 15:9 22:2,8	7	
13 1.J	working 7:23	13th 44:22		
$\overline{\mathbf{W}}$	8:15 13:4,10	14 3:4	<b>75</b> 15:9,13 19:23	
	14:18	<b>17-1</b> 1:5 4:4	20:6 21:13	
			1	